About Beyond Trafficking and Slavery

A wide range of activists, academics, trade unions, governments and NGOs are currently trying to understand and address forced labour, trafficking and slavery. Beyond Trafficking and Slavery (BTS) occupies a unique position within this larger movement, one which combines the rigour of academic scholarship with the clarity of journalism and the immediacy of political activism. It is an independent, not-for-profit marketplace of ideas that uses evidence-based advocacy to tackle the political, economic, and social root causes of global exploitation, vulnerability and forced labour. It provides original analysis and specialised knowledge on these issues to take public understanding beyond the sensationalism of many mainstream media depictions. It further works to bring citizens, activists, scholars and policy-makers into conversation with each other to imagine pioneering policy responses.

BTS is housed within openDemocracy, a UK-based digital commons with an annual readership of over nine million. OpenDemocracy is committed to filling gaps in global media coverage, helping alternative views and perspectives find their voices, and converting trailblazing thinking into lasting, meaningful change.

Find out more at: opendemocracy.net/beyondslavery

Want to contribute? Email us: beyond.slavery@opendemocracy.net

Cover Photo: Eric Hacke /Flickr. Creative Commons.
The Beyond Trafficking and Slavery Short Course

Volume 1. Popular and Political Representations ........................................ 5
Volume 2. Forced Labour in the Global Economy ................................. 7
Volume 3. State and the Law .................................................................. 9
Volume 4. On History ............................................................................ 11
Volume 5. Migration and Mobility .......................................................... 13
Volume 6. Race, Ethnicity and Belonging .............................................. 15
Volume 7. Childhood and Youth ............................................................. 17
Volume 8. Gender .................................................................................. 19
Volume 9. Possible Futures ................................................................... Coming Soon

All freely available at: openDemocracy.net/beyondslavery
1. Popular and Political Representations
Edited by Joel Quirk and Julia O’Connell Davidson

Moving beyond popular representations of trafficking and slavery 10
Joel Quirk and Julia O’Connell Davidson

Section one: political rhetoric and popular theatrics
The rhetoric and reality of ‘ending slavery in our lifetime’ .......... 20
Joel Quirk

The challenges and perils of reframing trafficking as ‘modern-day slavery’ ................................................................. 26
Janie Chuang

When human trafficking becomes a Cause Celebre .................. 30
Dina Haynes

Shilling fantasy as reality: a review of Trade and Holly ............ 33
Kerwin Kaye

‘Irish slaves’: the convenient myth ........................................ 41
Liam Hogan

Section two: challenging the white saviour industrial complex
The white man’s burden revisited .......................................... 46
Kamala Kempadoo

From Utah to the ‘darkest corners of the world’: the militarisation of raid and rescue .......................................................... 50
Garrett Nagaishi

Fielding the wrong ball: culture as a cause of ‘modern slavery’ .... 53
Sam Okyere

Residual causes: Wilberforce and forced labour .................... 56
Vanessa Pupavac
Feminism’s undeservedly bad reputation in anti-trafficking discourse 59
Ingrid Palmary

Section three: the mythology of a ‘few bad apples’

The politics of exception: the bipartisan appeal of human trafficking 64
Joel Quirk and Annie Bunting

Slavery and trafficking: beyond the hollow call ................................. 69
Neil Howard

Q&A: Extreme exploitation is not a problem of human nature....... 72
Bridget Anderson

Immigration politics, slavery talk: the case for a class perspective 76
Ben Rogaly

Modern slavery, child trafficking, and the rise of West African football academies................................................................. 79
James Esson

Section four: sex work and sensationalism

Domestic sex trafficking and the punitive side of anti-trafficking protection................................................................. 84
Jennifer Musto

From HIV to trafficking: shifting frames for sex work in India........ 88
Svati P. Shah

A guide to respectful reporting and writing on sex work .............. 93
Marlise Richter, Ntokozo Yingwana, Lesego Tlhwale & Ruvimbo Tenga

Rescuing the market? Comparing Agustin’s Sex at the Margins and Bales’ Understanding Global Slavery ........................................... 98
Bridget Anderson
## Section five: the politics of numbers, or quantification without foundation

Mapping the politics of national rankings in the movement against “modern slavery”

Siobhán McGrath and Fabiola Mieres

Miscounting human trafficking and slavery

Ronald Weitzer

How big is the trafficking problem? The mysteries of quantification

Sally Engle Merry

Human trafficking and Africa’s ‘pornography of pain’: the pitfalls of CSR

Marlise Richter & Joel Quirk

## Contributors

Contributors

## 2. Forced Labour in the Global Economy

Edited by Genevieve LeBaron and Neil Howard

Forced labour in the global economy

Genevieve LeBaron and Neil Howard

## Section one: forced labour in the world

What has forced labour to do with poverty?

Nicola Phillips

Forced labour under a changing climate: droughts and debt in semi-arid India

Marcus Taylor

The role of market intermediaries in driving forced and unfree labour

Kendra Strauss
Beyond Trafficking and Slavery

Capitalism’s unfree global workforce .................................................. 27
Susan Ferguson and David McNally

Section two: sector-specific dynamics
It’s time to get serious about forced labour in supply chains........... 32
Genevieve LeBaron

Food retailers, market concentration and labour ......................... 36
Sébastien Rioux

Free to stitch, or starve: capitalism and unfreedom in the global garment industry ................................................................. 39
Alessandra Mezzadri

Still slaving over sugar ................................................................. 43
Ben Richardson

Section three: existing policy responses
Harsh labour: bedrock of global capitalism ................................. 48
Benjamin Selwyn

Addressing forced labour in fragmented chains of production:
protect…respect…and remedies for the global economy? .......... 52
Fabiola Mieres and Siobhán McGrath

Global supply chains: role of law? A role for law! .................... 57
Andreas Rühmkorf

Modern slavery and the responsibilities of individual consumers .. 62
Christian Barry and Kate MacDonald

Section four: benchmarking and labour governance
The politics of numbers: the Global Slavery Index and the marketplace of activism................................................................. 68
André Broome and Joel Quirk

8 • opendemocracy.net/beyondslavery
ILO campaigns: missing the wood for the trees? ............................... 74
Jens Lerche

What would loosen the roots of labour exploitation in supply chains?................................................................................................. 78
Rachel Wilshaw

Basic income and the anti-slavery movement ................................. 84
Neil Howard

Forced labour is big business: states and corporations are doing little to stop it.................................................................................. 89
Genevieve LeBaron and Neil Howard

Contributors .................................................................................. 93

3. State and the Law
Edited by Prabha Kotiswaran and Sam Okyere

The role of the state and law in trafficking and modern slavery........ 8
Prabha Kotiswaran and Sam Okyere

Section one: The 2015 UK Modern Slavery Act

The Modern Slavery Bill: migrant domestic workers fall through the gaps ............................................................................................ 14
Kate Roberts

The dangerous appeal of the modern slavery paradigm............... 20
Judy Fudge

Anti-slavery responses should offer solutions not benevolence .... 24
Caroline Robinson
Beyond Trafficking and Slavery

Section two: the paradox of borders and antitrafficking campaigns

Anti-trafficking campaigns, sex workers and the roots of damage 30
Carol Leigh

Anti-trafficking: whitewash for anti-immigration programmes .... 36
Nandita Sharma

EU’s approach to migrants: humanitarian rhetoric, inhumane treatment ................................................................. 41
Judith Sunderland and Bill Frelick

Filipina entertainers and South Korean anti-trafficking laws .... 46
Sealing Cheng

Section three: the state, the law and gross labour exploitation

From brothel to sweatshop? Questions on labour trafficking in Cambodia ................................................................. 54
Anne Elizabeth Moore

The Protocol of 2014 is the new global standard to combat modern slavery, but will states make it real? .................. 58
Zuzanna Muskat-Gorka and Jeroen Beimaert

Gotcha! the ‘bait and switch and bait again’ of US anti-trafficking policy ................................................................. 62
Alice M. Miller

Centring the state in our critiques of trafficking ...................... 68
Katie Cruz

Law’s Mediations: the shifting definitions of trafficking .......... 72
Prabha Kotiswaran

Contributors ................................................................................ 76
4. On History
Edited by Joel Quirk and Genevieve LeBaron

The use and abuse of history: slavery and its contemporary legacies
Joel Quirk & Genevieve LeBaron

Section one: histories of official responsibility and culpability

Slaves of the state: American prison labour past and present
Genevieve LeBaron

Using US prison labour to make crime pay
Alex Lichtenstein

Bigger than the World Cup: state-sponsored human trafficking in the Gulf states
Laya Behbahani

Happy endings? Slavery, emancipation and freedom
Julia O'Connell Davidson

Servants of capitalism
Sara R. Farris

Transforming ‘beasts into men’: colonialism, forced labour and racism in Africa
Eric Allina

Section two: histories of political activism and mobilisation

Uncomfortable silences: anti-slavery, colonialism, and imperialism
Joel Quirk

The ‘new abolitionists’ and the problem of race
James Brewer Stewart

‘Not made by slaves’: the ambivalent origins of ethical consumption
Andrea Major
Beyond Trafficking and Slavery

Different times, same weaknesses: abolitionism past and present 60
Nelly Schmidt

Sexual surveillance and moral quarantines: a history of anti-trafficking .................................................. 65
Jessica R. Pliley

Anti-trafficking movements and journalism: who sets the agenda? 71
Gretchen Soderlund

Human trafficking: a parasite of prohibitionism? ............................... 75
Samuel Martínez

Section three: historical legacies and contemporary politics

A wall of silence around slavery .................................................. 80
Ali Mourssa Iye

Reparations are too confronting. Let’s talk about ‘modern-day slavery’ instead ............................................ 85
Joel Quirk

The everyday gender inequalities that underpin wartime atrocities 90
Benedetta Rossi

The legacies of slavery in southern Senegal ...................................... 97
Alice Bellagamba

Trans-Atlantic slavery and contemporary human trafficking: learning from or exploiting the past? ............................... 102
Karen Bravo

Britain must atone for its role in Maangamizi .................................. 106
Contributors .........................................................................
5. Migration and Mobility
Edited by Julia O’Connell Davidson and Neil Howard

On freedom and (im)mobility: how states create vulnerability by controlling human movement

Julia O’Connell Davidson and Neil Howard

Section one: the state construction of (im)mobility

Overcoming space: mobility and history
Laura Brace

The border spectacle of migrant ‘victimisation’
Nicholas De Genova

Illegalised migrants and temporary foreign workers: the international segmentation of labour
Harald Bauder

Fascist legacies: Italy’s approach to mobility and mobile labour
Patrizia Testai

Rethinking (im)mobilities of Roma in Europe
Julija Sardelić

Section two: the consequences of mobility controls

Families in detention
Roxanne Lynn Doty

Slave state: how UK immigration controls create ‘slaves’
Lucy Williams

The UK: the far shore for torture survivors
Rhian Beynon

Slavery, asylum, and the face of social death in modern day Britain
Roda Madziva
Beyond Trafficking and Slavery

At any cost: the injustice of the “4 and 4 rule” in Canada .......... 53
Stephanie J. Silverman

New mobility regimes, new forms of exploitation in Sicily .......... 57
Letizia Palumbo and Alessandra Sciurba

No agency: laying the groundwork to exploit of migrant workers.. 60
Kirsten Han

Freedom fighters: freelancing as direct action ....................... 64
Mark Johnson

Section three: trafficking and slavery

Bound and determined: new abolitionism and the campaign against modern slavery......................................................... 68
Edlie Wong

Rights talk, wrong comparison: trafficking and transatlantic slavery 72
Julia O’Connell Davidson

Silencing the challenging voices of the global ‘subalterns’ in anti-trafficking discourse...................................................... 76
Lucrecia Rubio Grundell

Safe migration as an emerging anti-trafficking agenda? .......... 81
Sverre Molland

‘Foreign criminals’ and victims of trafficking: fantasies, categories, and control ................................................................. 85
Luke de Noronha

North Korean migrants in China: neither trafficked nor smuggled . 89
Kyunghhee Kook

When spring comes, smugglers are in the news...................... 93
Inka Stock

Criminalising traffickers is an alibi for state-produced vulnerability 97
Lyndsey P. Beutin
Section four: a future beyond bordering?

Ferries not Frontex! 10 points to end the deaths of migrants at sea 104
The Alarm Phone

The case for open borders......................................................... 108
Joseph H. Carens

Thinking about open borders..................................................... 114
Antoine Pécoud

Contributors ................................................................. 118

6. Race, Ethnicity and Belonging
Edited by Joel Quirk and Julia O’Connell Davidson

Race, slavery, and the mythology of ‘colour-blindness’ ................. 8
Julia O’Connell Davidson and Joel Quirk

Section one: ‘modern slavery’ and the politics of race

The political economy of personhood ......................................... 18
Charles W. Mills

The antiblackness of “modern-day slavery” abolitionism ........... 28
Tryon P. Woods

Don’t call it a comeback: racial slavery is not yet abolished......... 33
Jared Sexton

Section two: racial slavery and its afterlives

The mythology of racial democracy in Brazil .............................. 40
Ana Lucia Araujo
Beyond Trafficking and Slavery

The present tense of (racial) slavery: the racial chattel logic of the US prison ................................................................. 45
Dylan Rodríguez

Racism, citizenship and deportation in the United States.......... 49
Tanya Golash-Boza

Shades of white: gender, race, and slavery in the Caribbean....... 53
Cecily Jones

Slavery’s afterlife in the Euro-Mediterranean basin.................. 59
P. Khalil Saucier and Tryon Woods

The politics of slavery, racism and democracy in Mauritania....... 66
E. Ann McDougall

Section three: ethnicity, belonging, and ‘modern slavery’

A master plan for Indigenous freedom ................................. 72
Jillian K. Marsh

Undermining indigenous self-determination and land access in highland Peru ................................................................. 77
Arthur Scarritt

Adivasis in India: modern-day slaves or modern-day workers? .... 82
Alf Gunvald Nilsen

The hidden injuries of caste: south Indian tea workers and economic crisis ................................................................. 87
Jayaseelan Raj

Warehousing Palestine ......................................................... 91
Teodora Todorova

Why Roma migrate ............................................................... 94
Will Guy

Capitalist dispossession and new justifications of slavery......... 99
Gurminder K. Bhambra and John Holmwood

16 • opendemocracy.net/beyondslavery
Section four: legacies and memories of slavery
RasTafari and reparation time .................................................... 106
Robbie Shilliam

Is memory enough? Remembering the racial legacies of slavery in France today ................................................................. 111
Nicola Frith and Kate Hodgson

The need for reparatory justice .................................................. 116
P.J. Patterson

Contributors .............................................................................. 121

7. Childhood and Youth
Edited by Neil Howard and Sam Okyere

Are we really saving the children? .............................................. 8
Sam Okyere and Neil Howard

Section one: are we really saving the children?
The (anti-)politics of ‘child protection’ ........................................ 16
Jason Hart

The cognitive dissonance between child rescue and child protection 20
Kristen E. Cheney

What do children need most: saving, rights or solidarity? .......... 25
Karen Wells

Child trafficking: ‘worst form’ of child labour, or worst approach to young migrants? ......................................................... 29
Roy Huijsmans
Beyond Trafficking and Slavery

Doing more harm than good: the politics of child trafficking prevention in South Africa................................................................. 32
Thea de Gruchy, Joel Quirk, Marlise Richter and Jo Vearey

Section two: child labour or child work?

Working children: rights and wrongs......................................................... 40
Michael Bourdillon

Prohibiting children from working is a bad idea .................................... 44
William Myers

Child work, schooling and mobility................................................................. 48
Jo Boyden and Gina Crivello

Child rights in the chocolate industry: a rocky road to progress.... 51
Amanda Berlan

Children, capitalism and slavery................................................................. 54
Hugh Cunningham

On Bolivia’s new child labour law ................................................................. 58
Neil Howard

Section three: child trafficking or youth mobility?

The creation of ‘trafficking’........................................................................ 64
Mike Dottridge

Pathologising young people’s movement.................................................... 68
Iman Hashim

Beyond child trafficking........................................................................... 71
Tanja Bastia

Young people’s migration and the pursuit of status......................... 74
Karin Heissler

‘Children’ in global sex work and trafficking discourses....................... 77
Treena Orchard

18 • opendemocracy.net/beyondslavery
BTS Short Course Series Table of Contents

Child trafficking: what are we really talking about? 81
Viviene Cree

Fake morals and forced identities for young migrants in Europe... 85
Brenda Oude Breuil

Contributors ................................................................................ 88

8. Gender
Edited by Sam Okyere and Prabha Kotiswaran

The gendered victims of (anti)trafficking ................................. 8
Sam Okyere and Prabha Kotiswaran

Section one: gender and ‘modern slavery’
Convenient Conflations: Modern Slavery, Trafficking, and Prostitution 14
Julia O’Connell Davidson

Workers, not slaves: domestic labourers against the law .......... 19
Eileen Boris

The need for a gendered approach to exploitation and trafficking 23
Letizia Palumbo

Migrant rights for migrant hostesses? When the anti-trafficking
framework runs out ..................................................................... 28
Hae Yeon Choo

American arrogance and the movement to end ‘female genital
mutilation’ .................................................................................... 33
Lisa Wade

Early marriage and the limits of freedom .................................. 37
Srila Roy
Beyond Trafficking and Slavery

**Section two: the persistence of the prostitution question**

The irony of criminalising prostitution as a form of ‘modern slavery’ 42
*Julia Laite*

Why decriminalise sex work? .......................................................... 46
*Global Network of Sex Work Projects*

Amnesty’s proposal to decriminalise sex work: contents and discontents ................................................................................. 56
*Simanti Dasgupta*

Decriminalising sex work in New Zealand: its history and impact . 61
*Fraser Crichton*

**Section three: the problem with ‘rescue’**

Violence in the safety of home: life in Nigeria after selling sex in Europe ........................................................................................ 68
*Sine Plambech*

Speaking of “dead prostitutes”: how CATW promotes survivors to silence sex workers ........................................................................ 72
*Jason Congdon*

Rescued but not released: the ‘protective custody’ of sex workers in India ......................................................................................... 76
*Vibhuti Ramachandran*

The anti-trafficking rehabilitation complex: commodity activism and slave-free goods .......................................................................... 81
*Elena Shih*

**Section four: gender and migration**

Who’s responsible for violence against migrant women? .......... 88
*Jane Freedman*

Immigration status and domestic violence ................................... 92
*Sundari Anitha*
Rape and asylum claims: credibility and the construction of vulnerability ......................................................................................................................... 96

*Vanessa Munro, Sharon Cowan and Helen Baillot*

Amnesty’s proposal to decriminalise sex work: contents and discontents ................................................................................................................................. 100

*Simanti Dasgupta*

Contributors .................................................................................................................. 105